

❖ ————— ❖

YESHIVAS IYUN HALACHA

TZAMAH NAFSHI
HILCHOS SHABBOS PROGRAM

VOL. I SHIUR 4
ד סימן שיח סעיף ד PART I
BISHUL ACHAR BISHUL



EDITION 2.1 - ELUL 5777

© MACHON IYUN HALACHA 2014

This shiur may not be reproduced in any form without permission of the copyright holder

...צמאה לך נפשי
...כמה לך בשרי...

(תהילים סג:ב)

This program is dedicated in honor and the merit of my wife Melissa Leah, and our dear children, Aliza, Yoel, Refael Meir, Aryeh & Ilana. May Hashem bless them with health and success in their endeavors.

May they grow in Torah and Chessed and learn yiras Shamayim from every event of their lives.

*by
Rabbi Dr. Chaim Bitton*

HILCHOS SHABBOS

VOL. I SHIUR 4

מראה מקומות

סימן שיח סעיף ד

קמה ע"ב *Mishna Shabbos*

פרק כב הלכה ח *Rambam*

ד"ה אפילו (דעת הרא"ש) *Bais Yosef*

ד"ה והא (דעת הסמ"ק ורבינו יונה) *Bais Yosef*

ד"ה אבל הרמב"ם (דעת הרמב"ם, *Bais Yosef*)

(הרשב"א והר"ן)

Shulchan Aruch

ס"ק יא-יד *Magen Avraham*

ס"ק כב-לג *Mishna Berurah*

ד"ה ואפילו *Biur Halacha*

Written by Rabbi Dovid Ostroff

סימן שיח סעיף ד - BISHUL ACHAR BISHUL

INTRODUCTION

In this se'if we discuss בישול אחר בישול, cooking an item that was already cooked. There are two issues:

1. If a food was only partially cooked, is it called cooking if one finishes cooking it.
2. If an item is already cooked and cooled off is it permitted to reheat it or is that called cooking.

In this se'if we will learn about מאכל בן דרוסאי. Ben Derosai were robbers that ate their food in a hurry. It is a *machlokes* if this is a third cooked or half cooked.

THE SOURCE

◆ קמה ע"ב Mishna Shabbos

Let us view the *Mishna*: (mentioned also on א"ע"א)

Any food that was immersed in hot water before Shabbos may be immersed in hot water on Shabbos, and food that was not in hot water before Shabbos may have hot water poured over it on Shabbos, with the exception of aged, salted food and a fish called "*kulias ha'ispenin*", because with them, pouring over them (hot water) is a complete melacha.

◆ Points of Clarification

A number of terms mentioned here require clarification:

1. Immersed in hot water before Shabbos - for how long was the food immersed in hot water, and to what degree did the food cook?
2. May have hot water poured over it - poured from which *k'li*, a *k'li rishon* or a *k'li sheini*?
3. Pouring over them is a complete melacha - which *melacha* is the *Mishna* referring to?

We will discuss the first question in this shiur and the second two questions in the next shiur.

Immersed or Cooked

◆ Rashi and Tosefos

Rashi and *Tosefos* learn that when the *Mishna* says that the food was immersed in hot water, it means that the food was completely cooked.

◆ Rambam

The *Rambam* (פכ"ב ה"ה) says: "Something that was cooked before Shabbos or immersed in hot water before Shabbos, even though it is now cold, may be immersed in hot water on Shabbos".

We see that the *Rambam* explains the *Mishna* as it reads that even if food was only immersed in hot water before Shabbos, it may be immersed once again in hot water on Shabbos.

Degree of Cooking

How cooked must the food be before Shabbos?

Let us approach the problem from a different angle: It is understood that one may add heat to an already hot, fully cooked food. For example: One may move a hot, fully cooked food, which is on a hot plate or *blech*, closer to the flame. However, is it *muter* to add heat to a food that is only semi cooked, as the additional heat will definitely cook the food?

◆ Machlokes Rishonim ¹

- ◆ *Rashi, Tur* - It is *ossur mid'oraisso* to completely cook a semi-cooked food.
- ◆ *Rashba* - There is no *issur bishul* once the food is cooked to the degree of מאכל בן דרוסאי, even if the food is now cold.
- ◆ *Rabbainu Yona, Rosh* - There is no *issur bishul* once the food is cooked to the degree of מאכל בן דרוסאי if it is still hot. Once it cools down there is an *issur*.

Accordingly, *Rashi* explains the *Mishna* that the food is fully cooked and only then may it be reheated on Shabbos. The *Rashba* explains the *Mishna* that once the food is cooked to the degree of מאכל בן דרוסאי it may be reheated on Shabbos.

Fully Cooked Cold

The second issue is if a food is fully cooked and cooled off, may one warm it up.

1. These *Rishonim* are mentioned in the *Bais Yosef*

♦ Rashi's Opinion

The *Tur* learns (as part of *Rashi's* opinion) that only a solid food may be reheated on Shabbos, but food with liquid ² once it cools down may not be reheated on Shabbos. This conclusion is reached, because on the one hand the *Mishna* says that food cooked before Shabbos may be reheated, and on the other hand *Rashi* says ³ that one is guilty of *bishul* if one reheats a cold food. Therefore the *Tur* makes a distinction between solid cooked food and cooked food that has liquid or is a liquid.

♦ Rambam's Opinion

The *Rambam* holds that food fully cooked may be reheated and no distinction was made between solid and liquid. The *Darchei Moshe* (ג'ק"ו) asks that this seems to contradict what the *Rambam* wrote that it is sufficient to immerse the food in hot water before Shabbos. The *Drisha* (ג'ק"ד בא"ד גם) answers that the *Rambam* holds that if the food is cooked מאכל בן דרוסאי it is called cooked.

SHULCHAN ARUCH

Food fully cooked which has cooled down may not be reheated because of the melacha of bishul. RAMA some hold that this is only if the food is מצטמק ויפה לו.⁴

Food not fully cooked, even if cooked to the degree of מאכל בן דרוסאי and even if the food is hot, is nevertheless ossur to cook any further.

The reheating that is ossur, only applies to food with liquid, but a cooked food item that is a solid (has no liquid), may be immersed in hot water on Shabbos.

A solid food item that has not been cooked before Shabbos, may not be immersed into hot water on Shabbos, but one may pour hot water over it on Shabbos, with the exception of aged salted food and a fish called "kulias ha'ispenin", which do not require much cooking, and by pouring water over them one completes the melacha.

***RAMA* This rule applies to all hard foods that cannot be eaten without first marinating them. Therefore one may not soak them (in hot water) on Shabbos, as it is a completion of a melacha.**

2. We will *be'zras Hashem* clarify how much liquid is allowed to be present. The *Bais Yosef* also discusses *Rashi's* opinion.

3. ג'ק"ד בא"ד words beginning "משחטה", five lines from the bottom of the page.

4. If cooking will enhance the food.

The *M"A* יד ק"ו points out that the *Mechaber* only permitted the reheating of cooked food, not food that was merely immersed in hot water, implying that he disagrees with the *Rambam*. See also *M"B* לא ס"ק and *Sha'ar Hatsiun* מב ס"ק.

Halacha l'ma'ase - the food must be cooked in order for it to be muter to reheat it on Shabbos.

Definition of a Solid Food

We find a *machlokes* amongst the *poskim* as to how much liquid may be present for the food to still be considered solid:

- ♦ Majority solid, minority liquid (chicken with gravy).⁵
- ♦ All solid, no liquid (rice, schnitzel, borekas).⁶

The *M"B* לב ס"ק writes regarding tea leaves: "the liquid was poured out", which can be understood that no liquid may be present, but nevertheless it does not have to be bone dry. The *Shulchan Aruch HaRav* however writes that no liquid is present at all.

The *Iggros Moshe* (ז) writes that one should be stringent in this matter and only be lenient when there is a dire necessity.

The *Yalkut Yosef*⁷ writes that the *halacha* is like the first opinion, nevertheless one who is *machmir* and does not reheat food which has a minority of liquid, merits a *bracha*.

♦ Halacha L'ma'ase

The *Mechaber paskens* like *Rashi* that only fully cooked food may be reheated, and differentiates between solid food and food with a liquid.

Cooled Down

What is considered 'cooled down' that would prohibit reheating?

♦ Sefhardim

The *M"B* כד ס"ק (according to the *Mechaber*) holds as long as the food is below בו יד, even though it has relatively hot.

5. *Bais Yosef* in רנג words beginning "ומה שכתב רבינו כל זמן". *P'ri Megadim* – *Siman* מא ס"ק אברהם ס"ק מא *Siman*, רנג אשל אברהם ס"ק מא *Siman*, רנט מש"ז *Siman*, רנג אשל אברהם ס"ק מא *Siman*, רנט מש"ז *Siman*, רנג אשל אברהם ס"ק מא *Siman*, רנט מש"ז *Siman*. *Kaf HaChayim* סב ס"ק סב *Minchas Cohen*.

6. *Shulchan Aruch HaRav* יה ס"ק יח *Minchas Cohen*, סימן שיח ס"ק יח *Chasam Sofer* עד סימן עד *The Elya Raba* wrote a צריך עיון (requires understanding) on the *Minchas Cohen*, meaning that he does not accept his interpretation.

7. Vol. 4 page 210

◆ Ashkenazim

The *Rama* in טו סעיף טו says that as long as the food has not cooled down completely it is still considered hot. The *poskim* explain this to mean as long as the food would still be eaten as warm food (which is warmer than "not cooled down completely"), *Iggros Moshe*, Rav Shlomo Zalman Auerbach and others.⁸

PRACTICAL HALACHA

- ◆ It is *muter* to place cold schnitzel, rice or any solid, cold, cooked food on top of another pot which is already on the *blech* or hot plate.
- ◆ It is *ossur* to place a cold soup on top of another pot that is already on the *blech* or hot plate. If the soup is hot: if it is above יד סולדת בו it may be placed near a heat source or on top of another pot already on a heat source, if it is less than יד סולדת בו but is still slightly warm, it depends on the Sephardic custom and the Ashkenazi one.
- ◆ To reheat a piece of meat swimming in gravy (minority) depends on the *machlokes* we mentioned above. One should ask one's *rav* which opinion to follow.
- ◆ *M"B* כג ס"ו says it is *muter* to place a cold cooked liquid into a *k'li sheini*. Therefore one may add cold milk (which is sterilized and homogenized) to tea⁹ made in a *k'li sheini*.

8. HaRav Sternbuch told me that he still prefers the traditional explanation of 'not completely cooled down' to mean exactly what it says!

9. Heads up British!!

CHAZORA PART 1

1. If one immersed a piece of chicken in boiling water before Shabbos, may one immerse it again in boiling water on Shabbos?
2. What is the implication of such a *machlokes*?
3. May one fully cook a food item that is cooked to the degree of מאכל בן דרוסאי?
4. The Tur says that one may not reheat fully cooked liquid. What made him reach this *psak*?
5. We permit the heating of a cold solid but not a cold liquid. Is one permitted to heat a piece of meat in a bit of gravy?
6. We know that a liquid that has cooled down may not be reheated. What is the degree of "cooled down"?

CHAZORA PART 2

Now it is time to review shiur 3. Read over the shiur and the Mishna Berurah and answer the chazora questions at the end of the shiur. Write down your answers (keep them as brief as possible) then compare them to the answers below.

1. *Toldas ha'ur - chayav*. On the fire - *chayav*. Direct sun - *muter*. *Toldas hachama - pottur* but *ossur*.
2. No, because the tank is *toldos hachama*.
3. It is *muter* if one takes a cold frying pan, cracks open an egg into it and places it in the sun. This way one is sure that the frying pan is not hot from the sun.
4. On Shabbos it is definitely *ossur* on account of *toldas hachama* and *hatmana*. Before Shabbos, the M"A holds that there is a problem of *mosif hevel* (adding heat), which is *ossur* even before Shabbos. R' Akiva Eiger holds that it is not *ossur* on account of *hatmana*.